

## Annex 1 – List of key informants

|     | Name                     | Title   | Interview status / Comments |
|-----|--------------------------|---|-----------------------------|
|     | IFRC Geneva              |   |                             |
| 1.  | Caroline Holt            | Director, Disaster Climate and Crisis   | 20 December 2023            |
| 2.  | Xavier Castellanos       | USG, National Society Development and Operations Coordination (NSDOC)   | 18 January 2024             |
| 3.  | Nelson Castano           | Manager, Operations Coordination  | 15 December 2023            |
| 4.  | Rika Ueno Harada         | Snr. Officer, Operations Coordination   | 27 February 2024            |
| 5.  | Francisco Maldonado      | Lead , Surge Capacity   | 4 March 2024                |
| 6.  | Gwen Eamer               | Former Ops Manager Syria/Snr. Officer Public Health in Emergencies  | 16 February 2024            |
| 7.  | Ombretta Baggio          | Senior Officer, Community Engagement/Also had been deployed to MENA in a strategic position for Syria during Earthquake operation | 19 February 2024            |
| 8.  | Sandra Durzo             | Senior Shelter Focal Point  | 21 February 2024            |
| 9.  | Pascal Panosetti         | Senior Shelter Focal Point  | 21 February 2024            |
| 10. | Angela Eaton             | Lead Finance Business Partner, Finance Business Partnering Unit   | 4 March 2024                |
| 11. | Sindizo Muzenda          | Senior Officer, Emergency Appeals and Marketing   | 9 February 2024             |
| 12. | Benoit Carpentier        | Comms Manager   | 9 February 2024             |
| 13. | Antoine Belair           | Snr Officer, Operations Coordination  | 7 March 2024                |
| 14. | Mike Goodhand            | Senior Supply Chain Lead: Strategy & Design   | 11 March 2024               |
| 15. | Marshal Mukuvare         | Surge Capacity, Senior Officer  | 09 February 2024            |
| 16. | Suzana Harfield          | Team Leader, Operational Membership and Movement Coordination   | 28 June 2024                |
|     | <b>IFRC MENA</b>         |   |                             |
| 17. | Hossam Khalil Elsharkawi | Regional Director   | 27 February 2024            |
| 18. | Mohamed Hamad            | Head of PMER and Quality Assurance  | 10 January 2024             |
| 19. | Hosam Faysal             | Regional Head, Health, Disasters, Climate & Crises  | 12 December 2023            |
| 20. | Jorge Asprilla           | Regional Head, Corporate Services   | 09 February 2024            |
| 21. | Mario Bindrim            | Human Resources Manager   | 20 February 2024            |

|     | Name                              | Title   | Interview status / Comments                            |
|-----|-----------------------------------|---|--|
| 22. | Haytham Qosa                      | Head of Regional Health and Care Unit   | 9 February 2024  |
| 23. | Goran Boljanovic                  | Regional Manager, Logistics and Supply Chain Programme  | 1 February 2024  |
| 24. | Salac Agali                       | Lead, Global Fleet – Global Humanitarian Services and Supply Chain Management Dubai                                   | 14 March 2024  |
| 25. | Nazira Lacayo                     | Deputy Representative for Operations for Turkey   | 26 February 2024                                       |
| 26. | Krystell Santamaria               | HDCC focal point for MENA   | 20 February 2024                                       |
| 27. | Nadine Haddad                     | PMER focal point for MENA   | 14 February 2024                                       |
| 28. | Dharmin Thacker                   | Procurement Manager, GHS & SCM, MENA Region   | 12 March 2024  |
| 29. | Nader Bin Shamlan                 | Thematic Lead, Operations Coordination  | 8 April 2024   |
|     | <b>Syria IFRC Delegation</b>      |   |  |
| 30. | Mads Brinch Hansen                | Head of Delegation  | 13 December 2023 + 15 February 2024 + 22 February 2024 |
| 31. | Sonja Veronica Bjorkland          | Deputy Head of Delegation   |  |
| 32. | Ramzi Saliba                      | Operations Manager  | 11 January 2024<br>21 February 2024                    |
| 33. | Laura Blanco                      | Strategic Partnerships and Resource Mobilization  | 9 February 2024  |
| 34. | Bital Dbouk                       | Procurement Delegate  | 30 January 2024  |
| 35. | Sarah Parisio                     | Deputy Ops  | 7 March 2024   |
| 36. | Roba Bashir                       | Finance and Admin Coordinator   | 28 February 2024                                       |
| 37. | Leticia Diego de Somonte Galdeano | Livelihoods Coordinator   | 29 February 2024                                       |
| 38. | Nino Burtikashvili                | NSD Delegate  | 13 February 2024                                       |
| 39. | Miki Takahara                     | Health Delegate   | 07 February 2024                                       |
| 40. | Chiran Livera                     | Head of Emergency Operations (Surge)  | 1 February 2024  |
| 41. | Dragan Luksija                    | Supply Chain Coordinator (Surge)  | 6 February 2024  |
| 42. | Raja Assaf                        | Former Syria Operations Manager (Currently based at the MENA RO but was deployed as an Operations Manager to Syria. ) | 1 February 2024  |
| 43. | Vincent Kiplangat                 | PMER Delegate   | 13 February 2024                                       |

|     | Name  | Title  | Interview status / Comments         |
|-----|---|--|-------------------------------------|
| 44. | Fadi Tannous                                  | Finance Officer                                      | 28 February 2024                    |
|     | <b>Syria Arab Red Crescent (SARC)</b>         |  |                                     |
| 45. | Bassel Houranieh                              | Performance and Partnerships Support Director        | 18 December 2023 + 14 February 2024 |
| 46. | Abdulaziz Alkharrat                           | Logistics Director                                   | 13 February 2024                    |
| 47. | Tammam Muhrez                                 | Head of Operations                                   | 13 February 2024                    |
| 48. | Youssef Al-Shreifi                            | Grants Management & Partnership Support Unit Manager | 14 February 2024                    |
| 49. | Samer Chakra                                  | Director of HR and Admin                             | 14 February 2024                    |
| 50. | Razan Jaradeh                                 | EMS Director   | 14 February 2024                    |
| 51. | Mazan Shikim                                  | CVA Unit Manager                                     | 14 February 2024                    |
| 52. | Nawras Al Ammatouri                           | Finance Director                                     | 28 February 2024                    |
|     | <b>Syria Partner National Societies (PNS)</b> |  |                                     |
| 53. | Praxedes Merchan                              | Country Manager British Red Cross - Syria            | 13 February 2024                    |
| 54. | Michael Tesfaye                               | Country Manager Canadian RC - Based in Lebanon       | 7 March 2024                        |
| 55. | Ahmad Fneich                                  | EQ Programme Manager German RC                       | 14 February 2024                    |
| 56. | Giulia de Cesaria                             | Danish Red Cross                                     | 13 February 2024                    |
|     | <b>ICRC</b>                                   |  |                                     |
| 57. | Assem Elessawy                                | ICRC's Operations Coordinator for Syria              | 23 February 2024                    |

## Annex 2 Key documents reviewed

- ❖ *Evaluation of the Red Cross Emergency Clinic ERU deployment to Syria 2023 – Finnish Red Cross (December 2023)*
- ❖ *IFRC and SARC – Syria: Resilience Strengthening Approach 2023 – 2025 Strategic Vision (April 2023)*
- ❖ *IFRC Emergency Appeal – Operational Strategy Syria Earthquake (12 March 2023)*
- ❖ *IFRC Emergency Operations - 2023 Key Figures*
- ❖ *IFRC Factsheet on Sanctions relevant to the IFRC response to the earthquake in Syria (7 March 2023)*
- ❖ *IFRC Joint Task Force presentations (various)*
- ❖ *IFRC Operation Update 1 – Syria Earthquakes (20 April 2023)*
- ❖ *IFRC Rapid insights on the earthquake in Turkiye and Syria (1 March 2023)*
- ❖ *IFRC Secretariat Emergency Response Framework – Roles and Responsibilities (April 2017)*
- ❖ *IFRC Turkiye and Syria: Earthquake – Key Messages (24 March 2023)*
- ❖ *IFRC Turkiye and Syria: Earthquake – Reactive Lines (24 March 2023)*
- ❖ *IFRC-wide Syria Country Plan 2023 – 2025 (September 2022)*
- ❖ *Joint Statement on the earthquake in Syria (11 June 2023)*
- ❖ *Resilience Strengthening Roadmap in the Aftermath of the Syria Earthquake and amidst a protracted conflict – Concept Note V2 (30 April 2023)*
- ❖ *SARC Branches Development Report – PER Assessment in Hama, Quneitra, Homs, Tartous, Lattakia (2021)*
- ❖ *SARC Earthquake Response – Monthly Progress Reports (various)*
- ❖ *SARC Earthquake Response and Resilience Planning Workshop Draft Report (June 2023)*
- ❖ *SARC Earthquake Response Plan (20 February 2023)*
- ❖ *Syria Earthquake SitReps (Various)*

## Annex 3 Evaluation Matrix

| Evaluation Criteria   | Evaluation questions and sub-questions   | Indicator/s  | Data Source/s  |
|---|--|--|--|
| <b>1. IFRC Secretariat coordination structure and operational intent</b>          |  |  |  |
| <b>Relevance</b>  | EQ1. How relevant has the IFRC's financial, technical and in-kind resource been to SARC in terms of scaling its response to deliver humanitarian assistance?<br><br>What has the IFRC's added value been in these areas? | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Extent to which 1) financial support 2) technical support 3) in-kind resources provided by the IFRC to SARC supported the scaling of SARC's response and delivery humanitarian assistance.</li> </ul> | <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>KIs with SARC, IFRC, PNS</li> <li>Document review</li> <li>Survey (TBC)</li> </ol>          |
| <b>Effectiveness</b>  | EQ2. How effective were/are the existing partnerships and relationships between the IFRC Secretariat, Members and the NS in terms of ensuring an effective response?   | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Extent to which partnerships and relationships are being used effectively.</li> </ul>   | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>KIs with SARC, IFRC, PNS and ICRC</li> </ul>  |
| <b>Effectiveness</b>  | EQ3. In what ways did the partnerships ensure/facilitate efficient and effective emergency preparedness for the response operation both before and after the earthquakes?  | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Instances identified of partnership action pre-earthquake to try and ensure preparedness for a large-scale response operation.</li> </ul>   | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>KIs with SARC, IFRC, PNS and ICRC</li> <li>Document review</li> <li>Survey - TBC</li> </ul> |
| <b>Effectiveness</b>  | EQ4. How has 'New way of working' (Agenda for Renewal), been implemented in this emergency?)   | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Instances identified of how the Agenda for Renewal was implemented including successes and challenges faced.</li> </ul>   | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Document review</li> <li>KIs with SARC, IFRC, PNS</li> </ul>                                |
| <b>Effectiveness</b>  | EQ5. To what extent were the Principles and Rules for Red Cross Red Crescent Humanitarian Assistance respected and implemented?  | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Level of adherence of the Movement members to the Principles and Rules</li> </ul>   | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>KIs with SARC, IFRC, PNS</li> <li>Document review</li> </ul>                                |
| <b>2. IFRC Secretariat internal readiness to respond in complex environments.</b> |  |  |  |
| <b>Efficiency</b>   | EQ6. To what extent are IFRC systems, tools, and decision-making processes fit for purpose for rapid and scaled crisis response in complex settings?   | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Extent to which HR surge deployments and ERUs were relevant.</li> </ul>   | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>KIs with SARC, IFRC, PNS</li> <li>Document review</li> </ul>                                |

| Evaluation Criteria             | Evaluation questions and sub-questions  | Indicator/s   | Data Source/s  |
|---------------------------------|---|---|--|
|                                 | <p>6.1 Were the <b>HR</b> surge deployments, including ERUs, timely and relevant to the needs on the ground?</p> <p>6.2 Were IFRC <b>finance</b> policies and procedures been sufficiently flexible to allow for smooth implementation, as well as adapted to the needs of the Syrian context?</p> <p>6.3 Have IFRC <b>procurement and supply chain</b> management processes been adequate to meet the evolving needs and intended outcomes of the operation?</p> <p>6.4 Have <b>logistics</b> decision-making structures been clear, effective, and appropriate for a complex setting?</p> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Extent to which HR surge deployments and ERUs were timely.</li> <li>Extent to which IFRC finance policies and procedures were sufficiently adapted to be efficient in the context.</li> <li>Extent to which IFRC procurement and supply chain management processes were able to meet the needs and support the intended outcomes of the response.</li> <li>Extent to which logistics decision-making structures were clear, and appropriate in the earthquake response.</li> </ul> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Survey (TBC)</li> </ul>                                       |
| <b>Efficiency</b>               | EQ7. Are the systems in place fit for purpose to deal in complex environments with <b>logistical and administrative</b> impediments?  | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Extent to which existing systems were ready to address logistical and administrative challenges.</li> </ul>  | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>KIIs with IFRC</li> <li>Document review</li> </ul>            |
| <b>Efficiency</b>               | <p>EQ8. To what extent has the status of disaster law in the country affected the goods and services' access to the vulnerable populations?</p> <p>8.1 How did the political and economic restrictions in country affect the delivery of services in a timely and effective manner?</p> <p>8.2 How were the relief efforts affected by the restrictions on movement of goods from neighbouring countries?</p>   | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Perceptions of the effect of political and economic restrictions on the delivery of humanitarian services in a timely and effective manner.</li> <li>Instances identified of how relief efforts were affected by restrictions on the movement of goods from neighbouring countries.</li> </ul>   | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>KIIs with IFRC, SARC, PNS</li> <li>Document review</li> </ul> |
| <b>3. Resource mobilization</b> |   |   |  |
| <b>Efficiency</b>               | EQ9. To what extent did/does IFRC's RM strategy and regular financial analysis and monitoring influence the funds received for this operation to ensure there were used efficiently and in line with the needs of the target population in Syria?   | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Extent to which IFRC's RM strategy and financial analysis and monitoring were used in line with the needs of the target population.</li> </ul>   | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>KIIs with IFRC, SARC, PNS</li> <li>Document review</li> </ul> |

| <b>Evaluation Criteria</b> | <b>Evaluation questions and sub-questions</b>   | <b>Indicator/s</b>  | <b>Data Source/s</b>  |
|----------------------------|---|---|---|
| <b>Efficiency</b>          | EQ10. How efficiently and effectively did the IFRC and SARC coordinate with donors to mobilize resources?   | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Assessment of IFRC and SARC coordination approach with donors.</li> </ul>                                    | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>KIs with IFRC, SARC, membership</li> </ul> |
| <b>Efficiency</b>          | EQ11. What is the capacity of the National Society to absorb and manage resources being delivered/ mobilized for this operation, including time, and earmarked funding? | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Level assessed of SARC capacity to efficiently handle resources in a timely and effective manner.</li> </ul> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>KIs with IFRC, SARC, membership</li> </ul> |
| <b>Efficiency</b>          | EQ12. How are resources being allocated and maintained to ensure the sustainability of the NS operational capacity?   | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Assessment of how resources have been allocated for sustainable operations.</li> </ul>                       | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>KIs with IFRC, SARC, membership</li> </ul> |

## Annex 4 - IFRC Syria Earthquake Response – Surge deployments

| Start      | End        | Title   | Incoming                       |
|------------|------------|---|--------------------------------|
| 2023-02-17 | 2023-04-17 | Communications Coordinator, Earthquake, Syria                 | Finnish Red Cross              |
| 2023-03-17 | 2023-04-28 | Head of Emergency Operations, 2nd rotation, Earthquake, Syria | IFRC Europe                    |
| 2023-02-09 | 2023-03-17 | Head of Emergency Operations, Earthquake, Syria               | The Canadian Red Cross Society |
| 2023-02-12 | 2023-03-16 | Health Coordinator, Earthquake, Syria                         | IFRC Europe                    |
| 2023-02-17 | 2023-04-17 | Medical Logistics Officer, Earthquake, Syria                  | Norwegian Red Cross            |
| 2023-02-27 | 2023-05-31 | Operations Manager, Earthquake, Syria (based in Lebanon)      | IFRC MENA                      |
| 2023-05-19 | 2023-06-20 | PMER Coordinator, 2nd rotation, Earthquake, Syria             | Lebanese Red Cross             |
| 2023-02-17 | 2023-05-16 | PMER Coordinator, Earthquake, Syria                           | IFRC MENA                      |
| 2023-03-10 | 2023-06-09 | PMER Officer, Earthquake, Syria                               | The Netherlands Red Cross      |
| 2023-04-26 | 2023-07-25 | PRD Officer, Earthquake, Syria (based in Lebanon)             | IFRC Americas                  |
| 2023-02-27 | 2023-05-31 | Security Coordinator, Earthquake, Syria                       | IFRC MENA                      |
| 2023-06-25 | 2023-07-24 | Security Officer, 2nd rotation, Earthquake, Syria             | Lebanese Red Cross             |
| 2023-02-20 | 2023-03-31 | Security Officer, Earthquake, Syria                           | German Red Cross               |
| 2023-06-01 | 2023-07-31 | Shelter Coordinator, 2nd rotation, Earthquake, Syria          | IFRC Asia Pacific              |
| 2023-02-20 | 2023-04-30 | Shelter Coordinator, Earthquake, Syria                        | Swiss Red Cross                |
| 2023-02-19 | 2023-04-18 | Supply Chain Coordinator, Earthquake, Syria                   | British Red Cross              |



## Annex 5 Procurement and supply chain data for Syria and Turkey

### Summary of lead time for Syria procurement through the MENA RO

| Description  | LR Date               | Delivery Date          | LR – Delivery date timeframe |
|--|-----------------------|------------------------|------------------------------|
| Body bags, white U shape, zipped   | 20-Feb-23             | 20-May-23 <sup>1</sup> | 3 months                     |
| Vehicles for Syria for 7 vehicles Toyota Landcruiser LC 300 (5), TOYOTA LANDCRUISER 76 SWB (2)             | 3-Mar-23 <sup>2</sup> | 16-May-23              | 2.5 months                   |
| Jerry can, Aquatainer™ 10L Collapsible - ICRC Standard 50 per pack x 400                                   | 14-Mar-23             | 25-Jun-23              | 3.5 months                   |
| KRELCOOSETA, Kitchen Set Family of 5 Persons type “A” - KRELCOOSETA  | 14-Mar-23             | 26-Jun-23              | 3.5 months                   |
| Tarpaulins 4x6m  | 20-Mar-23             | 6-May-23               | 2.5 months                   |
| Family Tents tunnel shape (51x299.41) and 23 sqm (500x447.67), Winterization Kit, Family Tent x 500, 23sqm | 20-Mar-23             | 6-May-23               | 2.5 months                   |
| Rubhall, Prefab, wareh, soft wall, 10X24 ALU, 2D O. Part of MSU cover, without logo, O                     | 7-Apr-23              | 7-Jul-23               | 3 months                     |
| Vehicles for Syria for 2 vehicles Toyota Landcruiser LC 300 GXR <sup>3</sup>                               | 13-Apr-23             | 16-May-23              | 1 month                      |

### Summary of Turkey data (all items from IFRC Panama and Dubai warehouses)

| Item Name               | No. of Items | IKD Number         | Date       | Origin    |
|-------------------------|--------------|--------------------|------------|-----------|
| Tent, Family            | 252          | IKDN-CHGES-23-0008 | 11/02/2023 | Panama WH |
| Tent, Family            | 202          | IKDN-CHGES-23-0007 | 09/02/2023 | Panama WH |
| Jerry can, Foldable     | 4,000        | IKDN-CHGES-23-0007 | 09/02/2023 | Panama WH |
| Blanket, Medium Thermal | 10,000       | IKDN-CHGES-23-0007 | 09/02/2023 | Panama WH |
| Tarpaulins              | 4,000        | IKDN-CHGES-23-0007 | 09/02/2023 | Panama WH |
| Kitchen Set, Type A     | 2,000        | IKDN-CHGES-23-0007 | 09/02/2023 | Panama WH |
| Hygiene Parcel, 5P/1M   | 2,000        | IKDN-CHGES-23-0007 | 09/02/2023 | Panama WH |

<sup>1</sup> This information was received from the Syria CO, but conflicting information from the RO states that this item was delivered on 27 February 2023.

<sup>2</sup> The vehicles required import permit approval and approval by the Ministry of Foreign Affairs in Syria. These approvals were submitted on 26 March and 2 April 2023.

<sup>3</sup> This information was received from the Syria CO but conflicting information was provided by Dubai Global Fleet which stated that the vehicles were actually delivered to SARC on 11 July 2023.

|                         |        |                    |            |           |
|-------------------------|--------|--------------------|------------|-----------|
| Tent, Family            | 528    | IKDN-HURLU-23-0006 | 13/02/2023 | Panama WH |
| Blanket, Medium Thermal | 14,235 | IKDN-CHGES-23-0005 | 09/02/2023 | Dubai WH  |
| Blanket, High Thermal   | 4,670  | IKDN-CHGES-23-0005 | 09/02/2023 | Dubai WH  |
| Body Bag                | 500    | IKDN-CHGES-23-0005 | 09/02/2023 | Dubai WH  |
| Household Kit           | 2,050  | IKDN-CHGES-23-0005 | 09/02/2023 | Dubai WH  |
| Kitchen Set, Type A     | 4,620  | IKDN-CHGES-23-0005 | 09/02/2023 | Dubai WH  |
| Tarpaulins              | 6,000  | IKDN-CHGES-23-0005 | 09/02/2023 | Dubai WH  |
| Tent, Family            | 450    | IKDN-CHGES-23-0005 | 09/02/2023 | Dubai WH  |